

1
2
3
4
5
6
7

8 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
9 NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA
10 SAN FRANCISCO DIVISION

11
12 IN RE OPTICAL DISK DRIVE PRODUCTS
13 ANTITRUST LITIGATION

14 _____
15 This document relates to:
16 ALL ACTIONS
17 _____
18

MDL CASE NO. 3:10-MD-02143 RS

**STIPULATION AND [PROPOSED] ORDER
REGARDING ADMINISTRATIVE
MOTIONS TO SEAL MATERIALS FILED
IN CONNECTION WITH SUMMARY
JUDGMENT AND DAUBERT MOTIONS**

DATE ACTION FILED: Oct. 27, 2009

19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

1 WHEREAS, the Court has set a briefing schedule for the parties' dispositive motions
 2 ("Summary Judgment Motions"), and the parties' Daubert Motions (Dkt. 2211);

3 WHEREAS, consistent with this Court's previous direction to the parties in connection
 4 with administrative motions to seal (*see* Dkts. 1021, 1625), the parties wish to avoid burdening the
 5 Court with *seriatim* sealing motions, declarations, and proposed orders that are likely to be filed by
 6 the parties and various non-parties in connection with (1) Summary Judgment Motions, including
 7 any supporting declarations, exhibits, expert reports, and/or other evidentiary materials
 8 (collectively, "Supporting Materials"); (2) Opposition briefs to Summary Judgment Motions,
 9 including any Supporting Materials; (3) Reply briefs in support of Summary Judgment Motions,
 10 including any Supporting Materials; (4) Daubert Motions, including any Supporting Materials
 11 ("Daubert Motions"); (5) opposition briefs to Daubert Motions, including any Supporting
 12 Materials; and (6) reply briefs in support of Daubert Motions, including any Supporting Materials
 13 (collectively "The Motions");

14 WHEREAS, in order to provide sufficient time for the parties and non-parties to identify
 15 sealable materials in connection with The Motions, all parties other than the Indirect Purchaser
 16 Plaintiffs ("IPPs") have agreed to the procedure and schedule set forth below in Paragraphs 1-4,
 17 and the IPPs have agreed to the procedure and schedule set forth below in Paragraph 5(a)-(f) with
 18 respect to The Motions filed in the IPP action;

19 NOW, THEREFORE, IT IS HEREBY STIPULATED, by and between the undersigned
 20 counsel for the parties, subject to Court approval, that:

21 Procedure With Respect to All Actions (Other than the IPP Action):

22 1. The party submitting materials in connection with The Motions (the "Filing Party")
 23 shall file under seal any document that contains or refers to information designated by a party (the
 24 "Designating Party") or non-party (the "Designating Non-Party") under any of the applicable
 25 protective orders entered in this action (Dkts. 923, 629, 1605).

26 2. Within three (3) business days after filing, the Filing Party must provide notice to
 27 any Designating Non-Party whose materials have been filed under seal pursuant to this Order.

28

1 3. Any Designating Party or Designating Non-Party that seeks to permanently seal
 2 information filed in connection with The Motions shall file an administrative motion to seal, a
 3 single declaration and proposed order in accordance with Local Civil Rule 79-5 no later than
 4 September 19, 2017, which is one week prior to the hearing on dispositive motions, addressing all
 5 of its sealing requests related to The Motions.

6 4. Upon resolution of all such proposed orders, any Filing Party that believes revised
 7 redactions may be necessary for the public version of any document previously filed may re-file
 8 such document with the sealed portions revised consistent with this Court's rulings.

9 Procedure With Respect to the IPP Action:

10 5. With respect to the briefing of The Motions to be filed in connection with the IPP
 11 action only (including initial motions, all oppositions, all replies, and all Supporting Materials), the
 12 following procedure and schedule will apply:

13 a. When a Filing Party seeks to file a document that contains or refers to
 14 information designated under any of the applicable protective orders entered in this action (Dkts.
 15 923, 629, 1605), it shall file such document under seal and must include a Notice of Intention to
 16 Seal Documents (a "Notice").

17 b. In the event the Filing Party intends to file material designated by a
 18 Designating Non-Party, the Filing Party must, within three (3) business days of filing a Notice,
 19 also provide the Designating Non-Party with the same materials it is required to provide to the
 20 parties to this action, with the exception that no material filed under seal by a Designating Party
 21 shall be disclosed to a Designating Non-Party.

22 c. Within ten (10) business days of the filing of a Notice, any Designating
 23 Party and/or Designating Non-Party shall inform the Filing Party whether sealing of any material
 24 is required and provide proposed line-item redactions of materials and exhibits to the Filing Party.

25 d. Within fourteen (14) business days of the filing of a Notice, the Filing Party
 26 shall file (i) a sealed courtesy copy of the filing that highlights or otherwise specifies any material
 27 requested to be sealed by a Designating Party or Designating Non-Party in accordance with Civil
 28 Local Rule 79-5(d)(2), and (ii) a public version encompassing the requested redactions.

1 e. Any Designating Party or Designating Non-Party that seeks to permanently
2 seal information shall file an administrative motion to seal, a single declaration and proposed order
3 in accordance with Local Civil Rule 79-5 no later than September 19, 2017, which is one week
4 prior to the hearing on dispositive motions, addressing all of its sealing requests. The
5 administrative motion to seal, declaration, and proposed order may be consolidated with the
6 administrative motion to seal, declaration, and proposed order referenced in Paragraph 3 above.

7 f. Upon resolution of all such proposed orders, any Filing Party that believes
8 revised redactions may be necessary for the public version of any document previously filed may
9 re-file such document with the sealed portions revised consistent with this Court's rulings.

10 IT IS SO STIPULATED.

12 | Dated: June 22, 2017

LATHAM & WATKINS LLP

By: /s/ Belinda S Lee

Daniel M. Wall (Bar No. 102580)
Belinda S Lee (Bar No. 199635)
Brendan A. McShane (Bar No. 227501)
505 Montgomery Street, Suite 2000
San Francisco, California 94111-6538
Telephone: (415) 391-0600
Facsimile: (415) 395-8095
Dan.Wall@lw.com
Belinda.Lee@lw.com
Brendan.McShane@lw.com

Acting as Liaison Counsel for Defendants

Dated: June 22, 2017

HAGENS BERMAN SOBOL SHAPIRO LLP

By: /s/ Shana E. Scarlett
SHANA E. SCARLETT

Jeff D. Friedman (173886)
715 Hearst Avenue, Suite 202
Berkeley, CA 94710
Telephone: (510) 725-3000
Facsimile: (510) 725-3001
jeff@hbsslaw.com
shanas@hbsslaw.com

1 Steve W. Berman (Pro Hac Vice)
2 HAGENS BERMAN SOBOL SHAPIRO LLP
3 1918 Eighth Avenue, Suite 3300
4 Seattle, WA 98101
5 Telephone: (206) 623-7292
6 Facsimile: (206) 623-0594
7 steve@hbsslaw.com

8 *Lead Counsel for Indirect Purchaser Class*

9 Dated: June 22, 2017

10 CROWELL & MORING LLP

11 By: /s/ Beatrice B. Nguyen

12 Beatrice B. Nguyen
13 CROWELL & MORING LLP
14 Three Embarcadero Center
15 San Francisco, California 94111
16 Telephone: 415.986.2800
17 Facsimile: 415.986.2827
18 bbnguyen@crowell.com

19 Matthew J. McBurney
20 CROWELL & MORING LLP
21 1001 Pennsylvania Ave., NW
22 Washington, D.C. 20004
23 Telephone: 202.624.2500
24 Facsimile: 202.628.5116
25 mmcurney@crowell.com

26 *Attorneys for Plaintiff HP Inc. f/k/a Hewlett-
27 Packard Company*

28 Dated: June 22, 2017

29 CROWELL & MORING LLP

30 By: /s/ Chahira Solh

31 Daniel A. Sasse
32 Chahira Solh
33 CROWELL & MORING LLP
34 3 Park Plaza, 20th Floor
35 Irvine, CA 92614
36 Telephone: 949.263.8400
37 Facsimile: 949.263.8414
38 dsasse@crowell.com
39 csolh@crowell.com

40 *Attorneys for Ingram Micro Inc. and Synnex
41 Corporation*

42 Dated: June 22, 2017

43 ALSTON & BIRD LLP

1 By: /s/ Rodney J. Ganske

2 Michael P. Kenny
3 Debra D. Bernstein
4 Rodney J. Ganske
5 Andrew J. Tuck
6 ALSTON & BIRD LLP
7 1201 W. Peachtree Street NW
8 Atlanta, Georgia 30309
9 Telephone: (404) 881-7000
Facsimile: (404) 881-7777
mike.kenny@alston.com
debra.bernstein@alston.com
rod.ganske@alston.com
andy.tuck@alston.com

10 James M. Wagstaffe
11 KERR & WAGSTAFFE LLP
12 101 Mission Street, 18th Floor
13 San Francisco, CA 94105-1576
14 Telephone: (415) 371-8500
Facsimile: (415) 371-0500
wagstaffe@kerrwagstaffe.com

15 *Attorneys for Plaintiffs Dell Inc. and Dell Products
16 L.P., and as liaison counsel for the Direct Action
17 Plaintiffs*

18 Dated: June 22, 2017

CARLTON FIELDS JORDEN BURT, P.A.

19 By: /s/ David B. Esau

20 David B. Esau
21 CityPlace Tower
22 525 Okeechobee Blvd., Suite 1200
23 West Palm Beach, FL 33401
24 Telephone: (561) 659-7070
25 Facsimile: (561) 659-7368
26 desau@cfjblaw.com

27 *Attorney for Plaintiffs Acer America Corp.,
28 Gateway, Inc., and Gateway U.S. Retail, Inc., f/k/a
eMachines, Inc.*

Dated: June 22, 2017

KLEE, TUCHIN, BOGDANOFF & STERN LLP

27 By: /s/ Robert J. Pfister

28 David M. Stern (State Bar No. 67697)
Michael L. Tuchin (State Bar No. 150375)

STIPULATION AND [PROPOSED] ORDER
RE ADMIN. MOTIONS TO SEAL
Case No. 3:10-md-2143 RS

1 Robert J. Pfister (State Bar No. 241370)
2 Jonathan M. Weiss (State Bar No. 281217)
3 KLEE, TUCHIN, BOGDANOFF & STERN LLP
4 1999 Avenue of the Stars, Thirty-Ninth Floor
5 Los Angeles, California 90067
6 Telephone: 310-407-4000
7 Facsimile: 310-407-9090
8 Email: dstern@ktbslaw.com
9 mtuchin@ktbslaw.com
10 rpfister@ktbslaw.com
11 jweiss@ktbslaw.com

12 *Counsel for Plaintiffs Alfred H. Siegel, as Trustee
13 for the Circuit City Stores, Inc. Liquidating Trust
14 and Peter Kravitz, as Trustee for the RSH
15 Liquidating Trust*

16 Dated: June 22, 2017

17 ROPES & GRAY LLP

18 By: /s/ Mark S. Popofsky

19 Mark S. Popofsky
20 One Metro Center
21 700 12th Street NW, Suite 900
22 Washington, DC 20005-3948
23 Telephone: (202) 508-4600
24 Facsimile: (202) 508-4650
25 mark.popofsky@ropesgray.com

26 *Attorneys for Defendants Hitachi-LG Data Storage,
27 Inc., Hitachi-LG Data Storage Korea, Inc.*

28 Dated: June 22, 2017

29 BLANK ROME LLP

30 By: /s/ Lisa M. Kaas

31 Lisa M. Kaas
32 1825 Eye Street NW Washington, DC 20006
33 Telephone: (202) 420-2200
34 Facsimile: (202) 420-2201
35 lkaas@blankrome.com

36 *Attorneys for Defendants BenQ Corporation and
37 BenQ America Corporation*

38 Dated: June 22, 2017

39 WINSTON & STRAWN LLP

40 By: /s/ Jeffrey L. Kessler

41 Jeffrey L. Kessler
42 200 Park Avenue

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
New York, NY 10166
Telephone: (212) 294-6700
Facsimile: (212) 294-4700
jkessler@winston.com

*Attorneys for Defendants Panasonic Corporation
and Panasonic Corporation of North America*

Dated: June 22, 2017

WINSTON & STRAWN LLP

By: /s/ Robert B. Pringle

Robert B. Pringle
101 California Street
San Francisco, CA 94111
Telephone: (415) 591-1000
Facsimile: (415) 591-1400
rpringle@winston.com

Attorneys for Defendant NEC Corporation

Dated: June 22, 2017

BAKER BOTT'S LLP

By: /s/ Evan J. Werbel

Evan J. Werbel
1299 Pennsylvania Ave. NW
Washington, DC 20004
Telephone: (202) 639-7700
Facsimile: (202) 639-7890
evan.werbel@bakerbotts.com

*Attorneys for Defendants Koninklijke Philips
Electronics N.V., Lite-On IT Corp., Philips & Lite-
On Digital Solutions Corp., Philips & Lite-On
Digital Solutions USA, Inc.*

Dated: June 22, 2017

EIMER STAHL LLP

By: /s/ Nathan P. Eimer

Nathan P. Eimer
224 S. Michigan Avenue, Suite 1100
Chicago, IL 60604
Telephone: (312) 660-7600
Facsimile: (312) 692-1718
neimer@eimerstahl.com

Attorneys for Defendant LG Electronics, Inc.

1 Dated: June 22, 2017

VINSON & ELKINS LLP

2 By: /s/ Craig P. Seebald

3 Craig P. Seebald
4 2200 Pennsylvania Ave NW Suite 500 West
5 Washington, DC 20037-1701
6 Telephone: (202) 639-6585
7 Facsimile: (202) 639-660
cseebald@velaw.com

8 *Attorneys for Defendant Hitachi, Ltd.*

9 Dated: June 22, 2017

O'MELVENY & MYERS LLP

10 By: /s/ Ian T. Simmons

11 Ian T. Simmons
12 1625 Eye Street, NW
13 Washington, DC 20006
14 Telephone: (202) 383-5300
15 Facsimile: (202) 383-5414
16 isimmons@omm.com

17 *Attorneys for Defendants Samsung Electronics Co.,*
18 *Ltd. and Samsung Electronics America, Inc.*

19 Dated: June 22, 2017

JONES DAY

20 By: /s/ Eric P. Enson

21 Eric P. Enson
22 555 South Flower Street
23 Fiftieth Floor
24 Los Angeles, CA 90071
25 Telephone: (213) 489-3939
26 Facsimile: (213) 243-2539
27 epenson@JonesDay.com

28 *Attorneys for Defendants Pioneer North America,*
Inc. and Pioneer Electronics (USA) Inc.

25 **IT IS SO ORDERED.**

26 DATED: _____

27 HONORABLE RICHARD SEEBORG
28 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT JUDGE

ATTESTATION OF CONCURRENCE IN THE FILING

Pursuant to Civil Local Rule 5-1(i)(3), I declare that concurrence has been obtained from each of the signatories to file this document with the Court.

/s/ Belinda S Lee
Belinda S Lee